arXiv:1703.02600v1 [math.GR] 7 Mar 2017

Normality in Hopf Galois extensions

Teresa Crespo[1], Anna Rio[2], and Montserrat Vela[3]

[1]Departament de Matemàtiques i Informàtica, Universitat de Barcelona, Gran Via de les Corts Catalanes 585, E-08007 Barcelona, Spain, e-mail: teresa.crespo@ub.edu
[2,3]Departament de Matemàtiques, Universitat Politècnica de Catalunya, C/Jordi Girona, 1-3-Edifici Omega, E-08034 Barcelona, Spain, e-mail: ana.rio@upc.edu, montse.vela@upc.edu

March 9, 2017

Abstract

For a Hopf Galois structure on a finite separable field extension, we prove a result which generalizes the fact that intermediate fields of a Galois field extension corresponding to normal subgroups of the Galois group are Galois extensions of the base field. We apply our result to obtain the nonexistence of some types of Hopf Galois structures on Galois extensions with Galois group isomorphic to alternating or symmetric groups.

2010 Mathematics Subject Classification: Primary: 12F10; Secondary: 13B05, 16T05.

Key words: Hopf algebra, Hopf Galois theory, Galois correspondence.

1 Introduction

A Hopf Galois structure on a finite extension of fields K/k is a pair $(\mathcal{H}, \mu)$, where $\mathcal{H}$ is a finite cocommutative k-Hopf algebra and μ is a Hopf action of $\mathcal{H}$ on K, i.e a k-linear map $\mu : \mathcal{H} \to \mathrm{End}_k(K)$ giving K a left $\mathcal{H}$-module algebra structure and inducing a bijection $K \otimes_k \mathcal{H} \to \mathrm{End}_k(K)$. Hopf Galois structures were introduced by Chase and Sweedler in [2].

In Hopf Galois theory one has the following Galois correspondence theorem.

T. Crespo acknowledges support by grants MTM2015-66716-P (MINECO/FEDER, UE) and 2014SGR 206; A. Rio and M. Vela acknowledge support by grants MTM2015-66180R (MINECO/FEDER, UE) and 2014SGR 550.

Theorem 1 ([2] Theorem 7.6)**.** *Let $(\mathcal{H}, \mu)$ be a Hopf Galois structure on the field extension L/K. For a K-sub-Hopf algebra $\mathcal{H}'$ of $\mathcal{H}$ we define*

$$L^{\mathcal{H}'} = \{x \in L \mid \mu(h)(x) = \varepsilon(h) \cdot x \text{ for all } h \in \mathcal{H}'\},$$

where ε is the counity of $\mathcal{H}$. Then, $L^{\mathcal{H}'}$ is a subfield of L, containing K, and

$$\begin{array}{rcl} \mathcal{F}_{\mathcal{H}} : \{\mathcal{H}' \subseteq \mathcal{H} \text{ sub-Hopf algebra}\} & \longrightarrow & \{\text{Fields } E \mid K \subseteq E \subseteq L\} \\ \mathcal{H}' & \to & L^{\mathcal{H}'} \end{array}$$

is injective and inclusion reversing.

For separable field extensions, Greither and Pareigis [8] give the following group-theoretic equivalent condition to the existence of a Hopf Galois structure.

Theorem 2. *Let K/k be a separable field extension of degree n, $\widetilde{K}$ its Galois closure, $G = \mathrm{Gal}(\widetilde{K}/k), G' = \mathrm{Gal}(\widetilde{K}/K)$. Then there is a bijective correspondence between the set of Hopf Galois structures on K/k and the set of regular subgroups N of the symmetric group S_n normalized by $\lambda(G)$, where $\lambda : G \to S_n$ is the morphism given by the action of G on the left cosets G/G'.*

For a given Hopf Galois structure on K/k, we will refer to the isomorphism class of the corresponding group N as the type of the Hopf Galois structure. The Hopf algebra $\mathcal{H}$ corresponding to a regular subgroup N of S_n normalized by $\lambda(G)$ is the Hopf subalgebra $\widetilde{K}[N]^G$ of the group algebra $\widetilde{K}[N]$ fixed under the action of G, where G acts on $\widetilde{K}$ by k-automorphisms and on N by conjugation through λ. It is known that the Hopf subalgebras of $\widetilde{K}[N]^G$ are in 1-to-1 correspondence with the subgroups of N stable under the action of G (see e.g. [5] Proposition 2.2). For N' a G-stable subgroup of N, we will denote by $K^{N'}$ the subfield $K^{\mathcal{H}'}$ of K fixed by the Hopf subalgebra $\mathcal{H}'$ of $\mathcal{H}$ corresponding to N' and refer to it as fixed by N'.

Childs [3] gives an equivalent condition to the existence of a Hopf Galois structure introducing the holomorph of the regular subgroup N of S_n. We state the more precise formulation of this result due to Byott [1] (see also [4] Theorem 7.3).

Theorem 3. *Let G be a finite group, $G' \subset G$ a subgroup and $\lambda : G \to \mathrm{Sym}(G/G')$ the morphism given by the action of G on the left cosets G/G'. Let N be a group of order $[G : G']$ with identity element e_N. Then there is a bijection between*

$$\mathcal{N} = \{\alpha : N \hookrightarrow \mathrm{Sym}(G/G') \text{ such that } \alpha(N) \text{ is regular}\}$$

and

$$\mathcal{G} = \{\beta : G \hookrightarrow \mathrm{Sym}(N) \text{ such that } \beta(G') \text{ is the stabilizer of } e_N\}.$$

Under this bijection, if $\alpha \in \mathcal{N}$ corresponds to $\beta \in \mathcal{G}$, then $\alpha(N)$ is normalized by $\lambda(G)$ if and only if $\beta(G)$ is contained in the holomorph $\mathrm{Hol}(N)$ of N.

In this paper we obtain that a Hopf Galois structure on a separable field extension K/k given by a regular group N induces a Hopf Galois structure on the extension $K^{N'}/k$ when N' is a G-stable normal subgroup of N. We give examples of application of our result.

2 Main result

Theorem 4. *Let K/k be a finite separable field extension, $\widetilde{K}$ a normal closure of K/k. Let $n = [K : k]$, $G = \mathrm{Gal}(\widetilde{K}/k)$, $G' = \mathrm{Gal}(\widetilde{K}/K)$. Let K/k be given a Hopf Galois structure by a regular subgroup N of S_n. Let N' be a G-stable subgroup of N and let $F = K^{N'}$ be the subfield of K fixed by N'. Let $\widetilde{F}$ be the normal closure of F in $\widetilde{K}$. Let us assume $K \subset \widetilde{F}$. Then if N' is a normal subgroup of N, F/k has a Hopf Galois structure of type N/N'.*

Proof. Since K/k is Hopf Galois with group N, we have a monomorphism

$$\begin{array}{rccl} \beta: & G & \to & \mathrm{Hol}(N) = N \rtimes \mathrm{Aut}\, N \\ & g & \mapsto & \beta(g) = (n(g), \sigma(g)) \end{array}$$

such that $\beta(G')$ is the stabilizer of 1_N. If $n \in N, \sigma \in \mathrm{Aut}\, N$, we have $\sigma n \sigma^{-1} = \sigma(n)$ in $\mathrm{Sym}(N)$. Now, if N' is G-stable, we have $\beta(g)(N') \subset N'$, for all $g \in G$, i.e. for $n' \in N'$, $\beta(g)n'\beta(g)^{-1} = n(g)\sigma(g)n'\sigma(g)^{-1}n(g)^{-1} = n(g)\sigma(g)(n')n(g)^{-1} \in N'$ which implies $\sigma(g)(n') \in N'$, since $N' \lhd N$. Hence the image of β is contained in the subgroup A of $\mathrm{Hol}(N)$ defined by $A = \{(n, \sigma) \in \mathrm{Hol}(N) : \sigma(N') \subset N'\}$. We define now

$$\begin{array}{rccc} \Pi: & A & \to & \mathrm{Hol}(N/N') \\ & (n, \sigma) & \mapsto & (\overline{n}, \overline{\sigma}) \end{array},$$

where $\overline{n}$ is the image of n by the canonical morphism $\pi : N \to N/N'$ and $\overline{\sigma}$ is the morphism making commutative the diagram

$$\begin{array}{ccc} N & \stackrel{\sigma}{\to} & N \\ \pi \downarrow & & \downarrow \pi \\ N/N' & \stackrel{\overline{\sigma}}{\to} & N/N' \end{array}.$$

Since $N' = \mathrm{Ker}(\pi \circ \sigma)$, $\overline{\sigma}$ is an automorphism. We obtain then a morphism

$$\overline{\beta} : G \to \mathrm{Hol}(N/N')$$

defined by $\overline{\beta}(g) = \Pi(\beta(g))$. Let $H = \mathrm{Gal}(\widetilde{K}/F)$. Since F is the subfield of K fixed by N', we have for an element $g \in G$, $g \in H \Leftrightarrow \beta(g)(1_N) \in N'$, taking into account

the definition of the bijection $a : N \to G/G'$ used in the proof of theorem 7.3 in [4]. Indeed, an element $n \in N$ acts on K as the element $\alpha(n)^{-1}(1_{G/G'}) \in G$, by [8]. Since $F = K^{N'} = K^H$, we have $n \in N' \Leftrightarrow \alpha(n)^{-1}(1_{G/G'}) \in H$. Following the proof of theorem 7.3 in [4], we obtain $\beta(g)(n) = m \Leftrightarrow \alpha(m)(1_{G/G'}) = g \cdot \alpha(n)(1_{G/G'})$. We have then $\beta(g)(1_N) = m \Leftrightarrow \alpha(m)(1_{G/G'}) = g$, equivalently $\beta(g)(1_N) = m^{-1} \Leftrightarrow \alpha(m)^{-1}(1_{G/G'}) = g$. Finally $\alpha(m)^{-1}(1_{G/G'}) \in H \Leftrightarrow m^{-1} \in N' \Leftrightarrow m \in N'$. Hence $\overline{\beta}(H)$ is the stabilizer of $1_{N/N'}$. Again by theorem 7.3 in [4], $\overline{\beta}$, corresponds to a monomorphism

$$\alpha : N/N' \to \mathrm{Sym}(G/H)$$

such that $\alpha(N/N')$ is regular and normalized by $\lambda(G)$ in $\mathrm{Sym}(G/H)$, where λ is induced by the action of G by left translation on G/H. Let now $\widetilde{F}$ be the normal closure of F in $\widetilde{K}$. Let $G'' = \mathrm{Gal}(\widetilde{K}/\widetilde{F})$. Since the left cosets G/H and $(G/G'')/(H/G'')$ are in one-to-one correspondence, we obtain a monomorphism

$$\alpha' : N/N' \to \mathrm{Sym}((G/G'')/(H/G''))$$

such that $\alpha'(N/N')$ is regular. If we prove that $\alpha'(N/N')$ is normalized by $\lambda'(G/G'')$ in $\mathrm{Sym}((G/G'')/(H/G''))$, where λ' is induced by the action of G/G'' by left translation on $(G/G'')/(H/G'')$, we will have that F/k has a Hopf Galois structure with group N/N'. Now, if $y_1, y_2, \ldots, y_r$ is a left transversal for G/H, $y_1G'', y_2G'', \ldots, y_rG''$ is a left transversal for $(G/G'')/(H/G'')$ and, for $g \in G$, if $gy_i = y_jg'$, for some $g' \in H$, then, for $g'' \in G''$, $gy_ig'' = y_jg'g'' = y_jh''g'$, for some $h'' \in G''$, since $G'' \lhd H$. We obtain then, identifying $\mathrm{Sym}((G/G'')/(H/G''))$ with $\mathrm{Sym}(G/H)$, $\lambda'(gG'') = \lambda(g)$, for $g \in G$, hence $\alpha'(N/N')$ is normalized by $\lambda'(G/G'')$ in $\mathrm{Sym}((G/G'')/(H/G''))$.

□

In the case K/k Galois, we get a slightly more general result that the one obtained by taking $\widetilde{K} = K$ in Theorem 4.

Theorem 5. *Let K/k be a Galois finite field extension. Let $n = [K : k]$, $G = \mathrm{Gal}(K/k)$. Let K/k be given a Hopf Galois structure by a regular subgroup N of S_n. Let N' be a G-stable subgroup of N and let $F = K^{N'}$ be the subfield of K fixed by N'. Then if N' is a normal subgroup of N, then F/k has a Hopf Galois structure of type N/N'.*

Proof. Let $\widetilde{F}$ be the normal closure of F in K. The proof follows the same steps as the one of Theorem 4. It is enough to take into account the isomorphism between $\mathrm{Gal}(\widetilde{K}/k)/\mathrm{Gal}(\widetilde{K}/F)$ and $\mathrm{Gal}(\widetilde{F}/k)/\mathrm{Gal}(\widetilde{F}/F)$ for the definition of the monomorphism α corresponding to $\overline{\beta}$. □

As far as we know, there is no characterization in terms of Hopf algebras of the Hopf subalgebras of $\widetilde{K}[N]^G$ corresponding to normal G-stable subgroups of N. Therefore our result is specific of Hopf Galois theory for separable field extensions.

3 Examples

We will apply Theorem 4 to discard some types of Hopf Galois structures on Galois extensions with given Galois group. The setting will be the following. Let G be a group of order n and G' a subgroup of G of index d such that no nontrivial subgroup of G' is normal in G. Let N be a group of order equal to n having a unique conjugation class of subgroups of index d with length 1. With these hypothesis, if K/k is a Galois extension with Galois group G and $F := K^{G'}$, then $F := K^{N'}$, for N' the normal subgroup of N of index d. If we know that a separable extension of degree d having normal closure with Galois group G has no Hopf Galois structure of type N/N', we may conclude that a Galois extension with Galois group G has no Hopf Galois structure of type N.

3.1 Galois extensions with Galois group A_4

Let us assume that K/k is Galois with group $G = A_4$, the alternating group. We analize the five possible types of Hopf Galois structures: A_4, $Q_{12} = C_3 \rtimes C_4$, $C_{12} = C_3 \times C_4$, $D_{12} = C_3 \rtimes V_4$ and $C_3 \times V_4$.

The classical Galois structure gives a Hopf Galois structure of type A_4. On the other hand, since $A_4 = V_4 \rtimes C_3$ and a quartic extension having Galois closure A_4 is Hopf Galois of type V_4, by [7], theorem 3, we get induced Hopf Galois structures of type $C_3 \times V_4$. Finally, since $\mathrm{Hol}(Q_{12}) = \mathrm{Hol}(D_{12})$ either both types of Hopf Galois structures arise or none of them does. We are left with cyclic and dicyclic types.

In both cases, we consider N' the cyclic subgroup of order 3, the 3-Sylow subgroup, and we have $N/N' \simeq C_4$. Then, the corresponding fixed field F gives a quartic extension with Galois closure K. Since $\mathrm{Hol}(C_4)$ has order 8, it can not contain G, and this extension F/k can not have Hopf Galois structures of type C_4. This proves that K/k has neither cyclic nor dicyclic (or dihedral) Hopf Galois structures.

3.2 Galois extensions with Galois group A_5 or S_5

Let us assume that K/k is Galois with Galois group $G = A_5$, the alternating group. There are 13 possible types of Hopf Galois structures. If we take $N \neq A_5$ a group of order 60, then N has a unique $5-$Sylow subgroup that we can take for N'. Since none of the groups of order 12 has holomorph of order divisible by 60, we know that $K^{N'}/k$ is not a Hopf Galois extension and therefore theorem 5 implies than N is not a Hopf Galois type for K/k.

Let us assume that K/k is Galois with group $G = S_5$, the symmetric group. Now there are 47 possible types of Hopf Galois structures.

The classical Galois structure gives a Hopf Galois structure of type S_5. On the other hand, since $S_5 = A_5 \rtimes C_2$, again by [7], theorem 3, we get induced Hopf Galois structures of type $A_5 \times C_2$. (Recall that an extension F/k of degree 60 with Galois closure K/k has

an almost classical Hopf Galois structure of type A_5, since A_5 is a normal complement of $\mathrm{Gal}(K/F)$ in $\mathrm{Gal}(K/k) \simeq S_5$.)

Checking on the remaining 45 types, we see that all but one, namely $N = \mathrm{SL}(2,5)$, have a normal $p-$Sylow subgroup. For a given N in that set, we choose N' a normal $p-$Sylow subgroup. Therefore, N' is a normal G-stable subgroup of N. On the other hand, the fixed field $F = K^{N'}$ provides an extension F/k with Galois closure K/k (K/F has order 8, 5 or 3 and S_5 has no nontrivial normal subgroup of order dividing any of these numbers). In the proofs of Propositions 3.2 and 4.11 in [6] , mostly arguing on solvability of holomorphs of groups of order 15, 24 and 40, respectively, we proved that F/k is not Hopf Galois. In this way, theorem 5 rules out all these 44 Hopf Galois types. We perform a computation with Magma to check that the holomorph of $\mathrm{SL}(2,5)$ does not contain S_5 as a transitive subgroup and then we have the following result.

Proposition 6. *Let K/k be a Galois extension with Galois group A_5. Then, the only type of Hopf Galois structures on K/k is A_5. The classical Galois structure realizes this type.*

Let K/k be a Galois extension with Galois group $S_5 = A_5 \rtimes C_2$. Then, the only types of Hopf Galois structures on K/k are S_5 and the split one $A_5 \times C_2$. The classical Galois structure realizes the first type and the second type is realized as the induced Hopf Galois structure by an almost classical Hopf Galois structure on $K^{<\tau>}/k$, where τ denotes a transposition in S_5.

3.3 Galois extensions with Galois group A_n or S_n, $n \geq 5$

Let K/k be a Galois extension with Galois group $G = S_n$ or A_n, $n \geq 5$. Let us assume that K/k is Hopf Galois of cyclic type. If N is a cyclic group corresponding to this Hopf Galois structure, we can take for N' the unique subgroup of N of index n. Then $K^{N'}/k$ should be Hopf Galois (of cyclic type). But we know by [8] Corollary 4.8 that a separable extension of degree $n \geq 5$ such that its normal closure has Galois group A_n or S_n is not Hopf Galois. We have then obtained the following result.

Proposition 7. *Let K/k a Galois extension with Galois group S_n or A_n, where $n \geq 5$. Then K/k has no Hopf Galois structures of cyclic type.*

References

[1] N.P. Byott, *Uniqueness of Hopf Galois structure for separable field extensions.* Comm. Algebra 24 (1996), 3217-3228. Corrigendum, ibid., 3705.

[2] S.U. Chase, M. Sweedler, *Hopf Algebras and Galois Theory.* Lecture Notes in Mathematics, Vol. 97, Springer Verlag, 1969.

[3] L. N. Childs, *On the Hopf Galois theory for separable field extensions*. Comm. Algebra 17 (1989), 809-825.

[4] L. N. Childs, *Taming wild extensions: Hopf algebras and local Galois module theory*, AMS 2000.

[5] T. Crespo, A. Rio, M. Vela, *On the Galois correspondence theorem in separable Hopf Galois theory*, Publ. Mat. 60 (2016), 221-234.

[6] T. Crespo, A. Rio, M. Vela, *The Hopf Galois property in subfield lattices*, Comm. Algebra 44 (2016), 336-353; Corrigendum, ibid., 3191.

[7] T. Crespo, A. Rio, M. Vela, *Induced Hopf Galois structures*, J. Algebra 457 (2016), 312-322.

[8] C. Greither, B. Pareigis, *Hopf Galois theory for separable field extensions*, J. Algebra 106 (1987), 239-258.